Aaron Knight
Currimulum and Instruction Masters'
California State University Sacramento
Cohort 4, 2022-2023

Annotated Bibliography

Aghasafari, S., Bivins, K., & Nordgren, B. (2021). Arts integration and culturally sustaining pedagogy: Supporting bi/multilingual high school learners in biology. *Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies in Education, 10*(1), 59-82.

Summary:

This research article focuses on college-level students and how to facilitate engagement, and belonging for students with disabilities. The literature tells us that students' success depends on being included, and having a sense of belonging in a classroom community. Three findings from the research were, 1. "Students with disabilities may benefit from more than just accommodations. 2. Disabled students want inclusivity, engagement and belonging. 3. Expressive arts programs are one way to achieve these goals." Students who are engaged are more likely to finish an academic program. The researchers are trying to understand what other supports beyond accommodations could be helpful; most research, groups all supports together and thus it is difficult to identify successful modifications beyond accommodations. The type, and severity of disability, creates a challenge for institutions to be effective with the proper supports.

Engagement may be a combination of behavioral, social, and emotional components. The researchers argue that expressive arts programs may be a way to bring students together.

Qualitative data in three sessions was analyzed using the qualitative method of phenomenology ("phenomenology is aimed at illustrating human experience and describing it in psychological terms."

The sessions were audio-recorded. Student art samples were photographed. Data was collected in an interview format during a debriefing session. Interview data was coded and restated into everyday terms. The essential themes that were found are state in the first paragraph 1-3.

Reflection:

The connection that the article and my research share are, how to support and engage students with disabilities. One of my focus students will be a special needs/disabled student. The importance of creating a safe space for students to experience art, and community has a well-documented body of research to show the wide variety of health and well-being benefits.

This article highlighted creating the environment of inclusion. Special needs teachers do advocate for inclusion with the general ed Students. The logistical constraints of inclusion do present challenges, but anything is possible if we think and find the solution. Engagement relies

heavily on the Instructional Aid's ability to modify tasks, based on the disabled student's physical abilities. I allow the IA to modify my instruction to provide access to their student.

Akca, F., & Kavak, G. (2021). Scale of visual creativity in art: A study on scale development and construct validity. *International Journal on Social and Education Sciences (IJonSES), 3*(3), 439-456. https://doi.org/10.46328/ijonses.94

Summary:

This article is trying to understand how to create and implement a creativity-measurement tool. The study was conducted in Turkey with 381 primary school children in grade 1-4 (48% female 52% male). The scale that was developed was based in literature and professional input.

The researchers make a case that creativity is a vital skill that is valuable in multiple disciplines not just in the arts. Imagination, outward thinking, decoding, seeing gaps, getting out of the main track, breaking out of the mold are thought processes that are used to be creative. Certain types of creativity "domain-specific" knowledge influences the type of creativity in an area of focus. There is a dilemma between academic grades and creativity.

The author acknowledges and defines the different ways the word art is used. One way art is use in an internal discovery of an idea that is brought to consciousness. The other way the word art is use is in a technical manner, "to make a product." To be an artist one must be curious. The mindset of the artist is wondering, learning, imagining what could be, allowing mistakes and wanting to see what they can make.

The research is built off of previous creativity measuring tools such as Guilford, Wallach/Kogan, Mednick (R.A.T), Torrance Test of Creative Thinking (TTCT).

The method of data collection was done as a survey model, similar to a Likert scale.

Reflection:

The connection this article makes to my research is the transfer of knowledge from the "art" world out to other disciplines. I emphasize in my classes that art is a process. We use the products to examine our thinking. This article references a variety of creativity measuring tools. These made me think about how I measure creativity in my classes. It also made me begin to think about what evidence could be used to quantify a creative act.

The development of a creative mindset is the ultimate goal of teaching art. Mostly in class we focus on techniques and concepts within the confines of a rubric, and project directions. Only in high-level classes do teachers talk about how ideas can connect to emotions, and convey meaning. To connect the article to my research I plan to use multi-part, creativity-measuring tools. This article has made me aware that one test or piece of data will not be enough to determine evidence of creativity.

Bishop E. (2014). Critical literacy: Bringing theory to praxis. In A. Darder, R.D. Torres, & M.P. Baltodano (Eds.), The critical pedagogy reader (3rd ed.) (pp. 270-280.). New York, NY:Routledge.

Summary: This chapter advocates for the integration of critical literacy to support student advocacy for their education. (Anderson & Irvine,1993), "Critical literacy is the learning to read and write as part of the process of becoming conscious of one's experiences as historically constructed within specific powers relations." Students who have a perspective of critical literacy will ask questions such as, "is the information reliable", "who was the author", "is the information helpful", "is the information bias?" "Those who are critically literate can not only understand how meaning is socially constructed within texts, but also come to understand the political and economic contexts in which those texts were created and embedded. (Freire & Macedo, 1987)
(Comber, 2001) "… argued that one of the best ways to approach critical literacy is to begin with multiple sources and opposing views to interrogate their construction by specific individuals with particular (always political) goals."

Reflection: The concept of critical literacy has to do with becoming aware of the unseen agenda in writing, discussion, images, etc. As our mode of gathering information becomes more accessible through the internet and devices that provide unlimited access to information, each person needs to become critically literate so we are not duped by false information. Teachers and classrooms are on the frontline of providing skills to the youth about how to see hidden agendas, bias, or misleading statements that could lead to believing incorrect information. Fake news and political propaganda are topics that I currently investigate with my students. We look at these issues through a design lens and talk about how these images are able to call people to act or manipulate beliefs.

After reading this chapter my perspective has broadened by making me aware that we can't passively consume media. Like most people I am guilty of scrolling through social media after a long day and wanting to turn off my brain and relax. I now see that this could be a very dangerous mindset to be exposing myself to in the uncritical way.

In my art classes it would be interesting to combine art critique and critical literacy skills. Examples such as, Degenerate Art of Germany, the Farmworkers movement, Picasso's Guernica, and so many more are ripe examples where critical literacy would be very useful to discuss how and why this art was made.

In conclusion, to be a teacher we must show our students how to, "understand the social and historical factors that influence social justice and injustice" (Bishop, 2014). This practice will develop a curious and skeptical mind for ourselves, our students and the future world.

Chin, C. (2013). Key dimensions of a multicultural art education curriculum. *International Journal of Education & the Arts, 14*(14). http://www.ijea.org/v14n14/

Summary:

This article aims to identify key areas of multi-cultural education. By addressing issues around multi-cultural pedagogy. The intent is for art teachers to integrate the concepts into their

curriculum. Veteran teachers were hesitant to incorporate multi-cultural lessons. Immigrant students make up the fastest growing population in schools.

Multi-cultural education focuses on justice, equity and respect for all students. The researchers reference James A. Banks extensive work on multi-cultural education in general education. The article provides an extensive contextual account of how race and education mixed from the 1880's up through present time.

The 6 areas the research focuses on are Content integration – The way information about diverse groups is integrated into the curriculum, Equity pedagogy – how teachers modify teaching tactics for different learners, Knowledge construction and transformation – critical thinking to give students a framework to better evaluate how an understanding was developed, Empowering school culture and social structure – encourages students to take action to reform institutions, lastly, prejudice reduction – decrease stereotyping and see each student as valuable member of society.

The data for this research was collected as interviews.

Reflection:

The information from the article will help provide context, perspective and a checks-and-balance for under-lying beliefs/misconceptions that I may hold. By being open and vigilant of how we structure teaching, and from what perspective we teach from is important to the inclusion of ALL students.

To build my sketchbook journaling activities I need to be inclusive in the types of examples I choose. Likewise, the article suggests that the style that the teacher presents in, will better serve different students. The main goal of multi-cultural education is for teachers to be self-reflective. The classroom can be a powerful place and as teachers we are responsible for using our position to create better students that can participate in the world.

Cunningham, B. (2018) Re-focusing the creative process: Blending problem-based studio practice and online reflection. *Journal of Problem Based Learning in Higher Education, 6*(2), 144-152.

Summary:

The purpose of the article was to investigate the process of reflection. The author of the article created a Reflective Inquiry question that students were required to use to check for understanding and clarity and develop critical thinking for the assignment. The method for the Reflective Inquiry tool was delivered and housed all online. The private space gives students a place to ask questions and for the teacher to individualize instruction.

Developing reflection skills must be taught. The teacher's feedback can help students navigate the unfamiliar path the creative process may take. Also, giving immediate feedback create a positive environment. The reflection journal entries are worked on simultaneously to give

structure to the learning experience. The effects of the reflection process, enhances other areas of the student's education. The students' reflection process should be used as a method, to mentally ask themselves, "what do I need to do to go to the next step", and give themselves purpose for the tasks they are working on. Reflection also set students up to be more effective during critiques. The digital reflection platform allows students to link to inspirations that they found online. Cunningham, B. (2018) "The RI consists of over a hundred prompts and is divided into eight sections: brainstorming, historical research, final idea, dialogue with materials, production, post production reflection, knowledge, and future" accomplishments.

Reflection:

This article is relevant to my research because I plan to use sketchbook journaling as one of my methods of data collection. The author offers insightful reasons to why he uses his reflective journal activities. The individualized feedback and personal connection the online format provided is a model that I had not thought of. The logistics of figuring out how to do online reflections might be worth working on. The article also provides evidence of how the students improved as a result of reflective practices. My take aways were how the author integrated the reflection activities throughout the assignment. Another take-away that I had was how much the reflection process influenced other parts of the journaling process. For example, the effects on focusing critiques and convergent thinking, to name a few.

Millett, C., Kevelson, M. J.C., & Mirakhur, Z. (2021). The Benefits of infusing the arts in a college preparatory program. *Journal for Learning Through the Arts, 17*(1). https://doi.org/10.21977/D917148321

Summary:

This article begins by highlighting the positive effects of art education. For example, the article highlights that students who are exposed to art are more likely to graduate, have a greater likelihood to vote, visit libraries as adults, and read as adults.

Unfortunately, art education programs have reportedly declined since 2013. Research also showed that non-white students and low-income students are the least likely to have access to art education and thus less access to culturally important information. Income is not the biggest factor to accessing art education. The level of education is the biggest determinant of your exposure to art.

Art education is shown to make cross-curricular connections, to help students make observations, envision outcomes, create innovations, and self-evaluate. There are many benefits that come from being involved in the visual and/or performing arts, that go beyond the classroom, and into society.

This research focused on students entering into college through a program called, The Princeton University Preparatory Program (PUPP.) This program is a three-summer support program for high-achieving, low-income local public high school students. This study aimed to understand

the relationship between levels of art exposure, and student experiences during high school, college and beyond.

The research used qualitative and quantitative data to address three questions. To what extent did the exposure to cultural events influence the participants? Did the length of time, or the amount of exposure play a factor in the results? Did the exposure to art and culture differ by status? What are the perspectives of staff, family, and faculty members who were receiving the art and culture exposure?

Reflections:

The information that I can use from this article to apply to my research, is the knowledge about the unseen benefits of art education. As a teacher I am looking so closely at the evidence, data collection and data analysis, that I might miss the fact that students gained so much more from the process of making their art, than I can see in my results. For example, the research states that students who participate in arts are more likely to graduate from high school. As an art teacher I need to be aware of the environment and support and encourage students to feel safe to experiment and have positive experiences, so they get those unseen benefits from their art class.

I also found this article useful in understanding the unequal access to art and culture. My students are at a title one school, from low to middle class families.

The research results in this study show that art and cultural exposure had a positive impact on the majority of participants in the study. This finding also, informs me that by including more contextual information about artists, and art movements my students will benefit. Another finding that will inform my teaching is; the research found that the duration of exposure to art and cultural events did not change between 1-year, 2-year, 3- year participants. This tells me that any exposure will have some benefit.

O'Sullivan, C. (2020). Revising with metacognition to promote writing achievement: A case study. *Journal of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning, 20*(3), 49-63. http://doi: 10.14434/josotl.v20i3.28675

Summary:

The article offers evidence for the benefits of revision, in the writing process. The author discusses how revision can increase confidence, and decrease the feeling of agony during writing. The author seems frustrated by the low quality of writing in freshman writing classes. Students often do not incorporate revisions that are suggested by the professors. The type of feedback effected the likelihood of the student incorporating it in revisions. Positive feedback was effective. Excessive feedback was not incorporated. What teachers focused on in their

feedback can affect the perception, motivation, and anxiety of the writer. Teachers should be careful to be empathetic and support students to self-reflect.

The author is advocating for a metacognitive (understanding one's thoughts and patterns behind your thinking) strategy that required students to identify the thought process during writing. Research has shown that metacognitive strategies are effective at scaffolding learning. To effectively make revisions a student must be taught how to identify errors and set goals to find opportunities to fix the errors.

The research questions addressed in the article are..
1. How does requiring metacognitive revision influence students' writing efforts and achievement over the course of the semester?
2. Does the type of revision (global versus local) affect writing achievement?
3. How does the students' perception, influence the writing process?

Reflection:

The article has opened my mind to how difficult it is to get students to incorporate feedback into their work in a meaningful way. Teachers can get frustrated if their time is wasted on suggested revisions that the students will not even use. To ensure the revisions provided in the feedback are use it will be important for me to make connections between the steps of the journaling process and how students will be held accountable. Revision feedback in the sketchbook journals will be in the form of written clarification in the margins or attached post-it notes. To ensure that the feedback is considered, the student will need to address their decisions to revise or not to revise in the reflections section of the sketchbook. I will give direct instruction that each student needs to reference my notes in their reflection statements. Sketchbooks will be sign-off on before the student can begin the formative assignment.

Peng, Y. P. M., Zhang, Z., & Ho, S. S.-H. (2019). A study on the relationship among knowledge acquisition sources at the teacher-and college-level, student absorptive capacity, and learning outcomes: Using student prior knowledge as a moderator. *Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice. 19*(2), 22-39. http://dx.doi.org/10.12738/estp.2019.2.002

Summary:

The study uses students from higher education institutions as subjects to understand the correlation between knowledge acquisition and ability accumulation. The concept of Knowledge Management developed by Nonaka and Takeuch (1995) explains that knowledge is data that has been interpreted, and then applied in a meaningful way to understand the problem and solution in a new way. The transfer of knowledge also depends on teaching models, and the teaching style of the teacher. The teacher centered style is the teacher at the podium with all the information. The second style is a shift to student guided, student voices, and not focused on one source of information. There are benefits to the student-centered style that improves ability and learning outcomes. The counter argument states that even though students are being exposed to the information; are they able to internalize, integrate and use the information to develop their own

capacity? This study also focuses on the absorptive capacity of students to understand the difference between knowledge acquisition and learning outcomes. Zahra and George (2002) argue that absorptive capacity is acquired through knowledge acquisition, knowledge assimilation, transmission and utilization.

Tacit knowledge is non-verbal, intuitive and cannot be specified in detail. Explicit knowledge is information that can be contained in a book and told to someone else.

The curriculum in higher education relies heavily on prior knowledge. The student's self-perception relates to how the learner established their own past. Not all learners have the same prior knowledge, but the learning process depends on the learner to grow over time, have an attitude to learn, be motivated to learn, and strengthen prior knowledge. Learners with more tacit knowledge can handle more complex knowledge and information.

Reflection:

I found this study to be useful in defining the different types of knowledge, tacit and explicit. The creative process relies heavily on tacit knowledge. The transfer of knowledge in the form of art techniques is all done as explicit knowledge. So, for the students to make a leap in their creative process; students need to access prior knowledge, which will all be different, and apply the information into a form that is non-verbal, intuitive, and not easily defined.

As the person who is guiding my students through this process, I need to use a combination of teacher centered transfer of information strategies, and student-centered strategies. A student's capacity to learn may be understood by the absorptive abilities to acquire knowledge, assimilate knowledge, transmit knowledge and utilize new knowledge.

Schultz, C. (2021). Transforming pedagogies: Adapting art school peer group design critique (the 'crit') for the humanities. *Practitioner Research In Higher Education, University of Cumbria*. *14*(1), 41-49.

Summary:

This article is about how to give effective feedback to students. The context for this article is a British MA humanities program focused around film theory, with a module of 13 students. The purpose of the research is to understand how classroom-type-critique techniques could be reimagined into an on-going, multi-feedback conversation. The ongoing critique process was used to create an ongoing conversation to enhance awareness of the students' thinking and thus improve learning. This article investigates how critique methodologies can be applied to non-art-based learning. The critique offers learning by doing and learning through feedback. The activity of sharing and asking questions was helpful in creating a community. The critique is an important process that has been used for hundreds of years in an apprentice to master

relationship. A critique involves planning, monitoring, assessing, understanding, and performance.

The researcher is very intentional about making the feedback, often, structured and not for a grade. This conversation style was done over a month and consisted of 5 different areas that provided feedback. During the critique discussions the researcher was careful not to over-power the conversation.

Reflection:

The relevance to my research that I found in this article is that, critique feedback is most useful while the idea is being shaped. My research will use journal entries as a way for the teacher, and other students to give feedback. The critiques should be use as a discussion, and give students an opportunity to go back to the revision stage of the process if they need to. To encourage learning through my unit of texture I must give students a metacognitive perspective of how they are thinking. Respectful, useful, and non-personal comments are a skill that need to be taught in the critique process. I must also structure the environment so that social advantages or power structures don't dominate the conversations. Critique is a skill that must start with small opportunities and eventually build to deeper metacognitive tasks. Asking students to discuss unfinished work may cause confusion.

Xiaoyu, J., Xu, T., & Zhang, Y. (2022). The role of metacognitive strategies monitoring and control in the relationship between creative mindset and divergent thinking performance. *Journal of Intelligence 10(*35). http://doi.org/10.3390/jintelligence10020035

Summary:

This research focuses on 3 questions; 1. Is a connection between mindset, and divergent thinking, 2. Is an interactive relationship between metacognitive strategy monitoring and control in the process of Alternative Use Tasks, 3. Do metacognitive strategies mediate the role between creative mindset and divergent thinking?

The method researchers used to measure, and provide student with creative problems to solve were presented in the form on alternative use tasks (AUT). These tasks were broken down into three properties, 1. Property use – this is when the participant use an object for its properties. 2 Broad use – this is when a participant reviewed an object, against a number of broad uses of other objects. 3. Disassembly - was a shallow, low-level use of a cognitive strategy.

The research found there is a connection between mindset and divergent thinking. A growth mindset provided an increase in divergent thinking solutions.

Reflection:

Mindset – The belief that our brains can learn. The belief that mistakes are opportunities to understand what went wrong. A perspective that if you try you will grow from the experience. A fixed mindset is characterized by giving up, thinking you can't learn and that mistakes will hold you back.

Metacognitive is a term used for the methods that can help a learner understand how they learn. Classroom culture is a significant driver for developing metacognitive mindsets.

My take away from this research that I can apply to my research and teaching are the findings that; by making multiple versions of a project students will overcome the low level, common, shallow metacognitive strategies in place of the deeper, slower, more meaningful strategies. I have noticed that when students work in a series of solutions the quality of the work does improve. Also, by creating multiple solutions students begin to understand how they learn, create and are able to adjust within their creative process.

I am planning to embed growth mindset tasks, such as goal setting activities within my sketchbook activities to improve the student's growth mindset. Thus, affecting their ability to express their creative process in Round 3.